

Mayor's Workforce and Economic Advisory Committee
April 14, 2015
United Way of San Diego County

Meeting Notes

Committee members present:

- Mark Cafferty, President & CEO, San Diego Regional EDC
- Constance Carroll, Ph.D., Chancellor, San Diego Community College District
- Mary Walshok, Ph.D., Associate Vice Chancellor of Public Programs, UCSD
- Reginald Jones, CEO, Jacobs Center for Neighborhood Innovation
- Cheryl Hibbeln (representing Cindy Maarten, Ph.D.), San Diego Unified School District
- Jerry Butkiewicz, Manager of Workforce Readiness, SDG&E
- Lani Lutar, President, Responsible Solutions LLC
- Omar Passons, Senior Counsel, Stutz Artiano Shinoff & Holtz
- Peter Callstrom, President & CEO, San Diego Workforce Partnership
- Joe Shapiro (representing Elliot Hirshman), San Diego State University
- Shaina Gross, SVP & Chief Impact Officer, United Way of San Diego County
- Ben Motten, President, Conner Network
- Jim Zortman, Sector Vice President, Northrop Grumman
- Ky Lewis, Vice President/General Counsel, SHARP Healthcare
- Don Rosenberg, Executive VP and General Counsel, Qualcomm

Committee members absent:

- Cindy Marten, Ph.D., Superintendent, San Diego Unified School District
- Elliot Hirshman, President, San Diego State University
- Magda Marquet, Ph.D., Co-Founder, Ajinomoto Althea

Others present:

- Kevin Crawford, President & CEO, United Way of San Diego County
- Jaymie Bradford, Deputy Chief of Staff and Chief of Policy, Office of the Mayor, City of San Diego
- Katherine Johnston, Policy Director, Office of the Mayor, City of San Diego
- Patricia Dewar, Youth Development Program Coordinator, City of San Diego
- Ashley Swartout, Economic Development Manager, San Diego Regional EDC

The meeting was called to order by Mark Cafferty at 3:05 p.m.

Mark Cafferty welcomed attendees and members around the table and thanked United Way of San Diego County for hosting the meeting. Mark Cafferty then introduced Kevin Crawford, President & CEO of United Way of San Diego County.

Kevin Crawford thanked the group for coming together and stepping up to take on this important work. He noted that the purpose of the committee—to help all San Diegans thrive in our growing economy—closely mirrors the mission of the United Way, and that he was honored to have the group convene in the United Way offices.

Following Kevin's remarks, Mark Cafferty provided a recap of the purpose of the committee and walked the group through a set of bylaws/guidelines to help with committee meeting and voting procedures. He then asked the committee members for their thoughts, feedback and suggestions for improvement or additions to the procedures. The following feedback was provided:

- Because of the international travel schedules of some of the committee's members, Mary Walshok pointed out that there may be moments where in-person and phone-in attendance will not be possible for meetings/votes. In addition to the possibility of assigning an alternate representative, Mary indicated that we should allow for e-mail voting/participation (during rare circumstances) if we need to ensure that we have a majority of members weighing in on important issues and decisions. While this would be an unlikely occurrence, the group did want to amend the voting procedures to leave room for e-mail participation if/when needed.
- As stated above, the group felt strongly that if a committee member is to be absent, he/she should have the opportunity to identify an alternate to vote in his/her place. Although alternates do not have to be officially designated for each member, it is recommended that if there is an alternate identified, it be the same person for all meetings in which the committee member is absent.
- Committee members agreed to expand on the group's purpose statement from: "...*increase opportunities for young people in the fields of science and technology,*" to also include engineering and mathematics, so as to be fully inclusive of the STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics)/STEAM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Art and Mathematics) philosophy in particular; as it is the significant requirement for engineering professionals throughout the region.

Following the discussion, a motion was made by Ben Motten and seconded by Cheryl Hibbeln to approve the meeting and voting procedures, with recommended edits. The motion passed unanimously.

Mark Cafferty reiterated that the group has been tasked with conducting a scan of local and national education and training programs, employer-led initiatives and grant opportunities at all levels from K-12, through higher education and adult learning. Further, by the end of the committee term in July, the group is to identify a series of recommendations or actions, based on the scan, that can serve as a catalyst for collaboration among educators, training providers, workforce and economic development professionals, business leaders and politicians to ensure that all San Diegans have an opportunity to succeed, contribute and prosper within our city. It would be encouraged and recommended that a smaller

subset of this group continue to meet regularly past the July timeframe in order to see through and expand upon some of the recommendations and ideas that will be shared with the city's leadership. Additional thoughts that arose during the conversation included:

- Jaymie Bradford added that the Mayor had hoped to join the group for the discussion. He is extremely appreciative of the time and coordinated efforts of the committee and will certainly be present for later meetings. Jaymie also noted that she and the Mayor want to give the group plenty of room to operate on its own while considering ideas and options to bring forward for discussion and recommendation. Patricia Dewar, Youth Development Program Coordinator, City of San Diego and Katherine Johnston, Policy Director, Office of the Mayor, City of San Diego, have been identified by the Mayor to support the efforts of the committee and ensure the Mayor stays well connected to the discussion.
- Mary Walshok emphasized the importance of small businesses, incubators and the overall entrepreneurial nature of our region, and requested that the committee seek an overview of programs relating to the needs of small businesses.
- Mark Cafferty agreed, also noting the focus on community and neighborhood development (like the programs associated with the Jacobs Center for Neighborhood Innovation, the United Way, etc.) and employer-led training initiatives (e.g. Qualcomm's Thinkabit lab, the Salk Institute's Mobile Lab, etc.).
- Peter Callstrom requested clarification on the focus of young people versus all San Diegans – it was noted that we are in fact focusing on the broader population and that the next few meetings should focus more heavily on unemployed and lower-wage workers.
- Ben Motten noted that for many small businesses there is a general lack of awareness of the resources available to support their growth and hiring needs, and that unified communication to highlight the training programs and incentives would be beneficial.
- Jaymie Bradford responded to Ben Motten's comments by mentioning that the City is in the process of revamping their website to include a workforce section that would highlight and connect both individuals and businesses to these resources.
- Constance Carroll stressed the importance of expanding communication between business and education and getting our local dialogue focused on the most important emerging jobs/sectors in our region and how to access training for them.

The comments by the committee allowed for a perfect segue for Mark Cafferty to turn the meeting over to Peter Callstrom to provide an update on the Workforce Partnership's Priority Sectors, Connect2Careers and Workforce Conference.

Peter Callstrom indicated that in partnership with the San Diego Community College District, the Workforce Partnership conducted research to highlight and promote San Diego's five Priority Sectors: Advanced Manufacturing, Clean Energy, Health Care, Information and Communication Technologies, and Life Sciences. He pointed out that Priority Sector career posters highlighting career pathways within the five priority sectors have been created and will be printed for posting in all middle and high schools throughout the region. Each poster includes information about the top jobs, education and skill requirements, and median wages. It is all presented in a digestible one-sheet format, designed

specifically for students in grades K-12. Peter recognized that the ongoing challenge will be keeping the data current and ensuring the materials are broadly disseminated. The following comments were provided in response to Peter's update:

- Mary Walshok announced that her team is working on an inventory of education and training programs that relate to the five sectors, which should be completed in September of this year.
- Jim Zortman noted that the poster boards are certainly visually appealing but we need to translate the information into a format the audience uses on a daily basis – he recommended an app be created to highlight the data and information.
- Mark Cafferty asked whether fields such as cyber/UAS were represented well enough within these priority sectors?
- Jim Zortman responded, noting that software, communication and engineering do a decent job of representing and encapsulating the opportunities. He added that engineering in general is a gateway to high/well-paying jobs.
- Ben Motten further recommended that a QR code be created for users to scan the information and be able to open a roadmap for accessing education and training opportunities relating to the five sectors.
- Ky Lewis added that it would be beneficial to highlight how the various sectors translate to one another – for example, how does healthcare cross over to other sectors (such as life sciences) and how can we best communicate that message.
- Cheryl Hibbeln called for a position like a “navigator” to address this communication and to work within the K-12 system to teach counselors the language. She further noted the enormous gap in communication between what happens/ is needed in industry and what is communicated/ taught in schools. The navigator model has been used successfully in San Diego for certain programs and career efforts.
- Jim Zortman added there is a lack of communication about the opportunities available at the high school graduate and associate's degree levels, specifically the various pathways/coursework needed to either get a specific job or transfer to acquire additional certificates (highlighting the concept that it is often a series of stackable credentials or certificates that are needed for sustained employment).
- Reginald Jones agreed that career counseling (and navigation to appropriate training programs) in the schools, not just within K-12 but through the colleges and universities, has to be addressed.
- Constance Carroll noted again that there are huge communication gaps, adding that San Diego Community College District is the largest single trainer in San Diego County, yet is not as well connected as they should be to K-12, universities, businesses and industry sectors.
- Mark Cafferty commented on the messaging of our traded economies and noted that it is broadly known that our region is built on our innovation, military and tourism sectors; supported by our local economy. Building off of this—and acknowledging the workforce and community college system have conducted research and agreed on the discussed five priority sectors—he posed the following question/idea to the group: Do we want to put an emphasis on these five sectors as key drivers of our workforce efforts (and recommendations to the city), ensuring we also keep in mind how entrepreneurship plays into these five sectors? The question was not necessarily posed for immediate reaction, but something for the group to consider in its overall deliberations. The group appeared to have a very positive reaction to this concept.

Constance Carroll was then invited to review the San Diego Community College District's Career Technical Education and Summer Bridge Program Updates. She provided an overview of the recent California Career Pathway Trust (CCPT) grant applications submitted on behalf of the San Diego County College and Career Readiness Consortium. Two separate applications arranged by the priority sectors were submitted. Application 1 focuses on Advanced Manufacturing, Clean Energy, and Information and Communication Technologies, while application 2 is geared toward Healthcare and Life Sciences. Announcements regarding awards for CCPT applications are expected in May 2015.

Additionally, Constance Carroll highlighted the Department of Labor's American Apprenticeship grant opportunity, currently open through April 30, 2015. Grant awards will support public-private partnerships that promote the expansion of quality and innovative Registered Apprenticeship programs. Lastly, she discussed the Summer Bridge Programs offered at San Diego City, Mesa and Miramar Colleges. These programs are designed to support the basic skill needs of first-time college students, particularly recent high school graduates.

Constance Carroll concluded her comments by highlighting a prospective model for career and technical education to include the following elements: an overview of the field of study/priority sector, basic skills adapted to the sector, internships and additional supports for the student. She noted there is a significant need to strengthen industry partnerships and increase work-based learning (WBL) opportunities.

Committee member comments were as follows:

- Jerry Butkiewicz thanked Constance for the presentation and noted that strengthening industry partnerships is exactly the type of issue this group needs to take on. However, he asked whether we know the number of internships that other cities do and if we have the capacity to address the need? Are there grants to support these activities? If not internships, what can San Diego companies provide as work-based learning opportunities?
- Mark Cafferty provided some background on Boston and the culture of internships in the city versus San Diego, stating that Boston has had decades of history in providing internships for young people that was rooted in the needs of its financial sector, healthcare industry and other large companies. However, we need to look at San Diego employers and create a culture that addresses our own needs/gaps, while engaging and supporting a culture of entrepreneurial, small businesses.
- Mary Walshok added that San Diego does not have the same employer landscape. San Diego receives large amounts of money from the federal government to support our R&D and Defense sectors that may not allow for these types of WBL experiences to be supported.
- Jim Zortman noted that Northrop Grumman has a traditional internship model, but also has other/lower-cost models for providing WBL opportunities to young people. He added that transportation funding/issues prohibit access to the region's underrepresented populations.
- Jerry Butkiewicz added that when looking to re-engage the business community in strengthening these partnerships we can't lead with asking solely for paid internships. This has and will turn employers off too quickly.
- Constance Carroll agreed there must be a beginning, middle and end continuum of how businesses can engage with education and training.

- Ben Motten noted the significant cost/issue of liability to small businesses looking to engage in internships or other WBL activities.
- Lani Lutar added that there are methods for addressing these and other issues through university relations/academic internship programs, yet it goes back to the issue of fragmented communication and leadership with the universities to better connect and educate small businesses.
- Omar Passons talked about using neighborhood resources (such as libraries and community centers) to support our small businesses.
- Peter Callstrom announced the Mayor has included \$250K in the budget in support of the Connect2Careers (internship) program. The Workforce Partnership, along with support from the business community, intends to match the amount for a total of \$500K to support summer youth employment; with the goal of 1,000 placements. He noted they are looking for greater community and business engagement and have launched the #MyFirstJobSD social media campaign calling for prominent San Diegans to address the question: What was your first job?
- Shaina Gross asked: How do we cultivate more slots for young people?
- Mary Walshok pointed out that we need to find the value in what employers are already doing and figure out how to plug into it and expand to other companies/clusters. She also agreed that transportation is an issue; and something we need to figure out how to support to ensure we are reaching the underserved populations.
- Mark Cafferty concurred there are positive models that need to be looked at, like Qualcomm's Thinkabit lab, Biogen Idec's Community Lab, Life Sciences Summer Institute, etc. We must identify how we can support employer engagement and what models are working in San Diego.
- Peter Callstrom added that Workforce Partnership's Workforce Conference is being scheduled for late October/early November, and that perhaps we could tie in an unveiling of the Committee's recommendations/actions by the Mayor.
- Joe Shapiro recommended a sort of Venn diagram be designed to connect K-12, community colleges, universities, industry, government and economic development with the five priority sectors.
- Mark Cafferty agreed the group needs to identify creative ways to increase the awareness of students, while being responsive to industry.
- Joe Shapiro posed the following questions: How does industry want to engage? What can they do or what do they want to do?
- Omar Passons mentioned the need to speed up the process and build in incentives to engage businesses.
- Jerry Butkiewicz asked at what level do we want/need to target for exposure, and whether early exposure is ideal?
- Don Rosenberg pointed out that 70% of Qualcomm's workforce is made up of engineers and we need to continue to let young people see the incredible opportunities available to them. He pointed to QCamp as a program within Qualcomm to engage young people; and also noted the importance of teacher training to get broader exposure to students.
- Cheryl Hibbeln mentioned a strengths assessment students take in 8th grade to help them identify what fields they may excel in, but noted it needs to be better translated to the opportunities available.

- Jerry Butkiewicz stated that apprenticeship models have been around for years and connect to good paying jobs. He further commented that it is our job to tell students where they should be focusing.
- Ben Motten mentioned programs such as FBLA, which expose students to entrepreneurship and business practices. It is a ‘Try it; you might like it’ model... and perhaps it’s even better if the student finds out he/she doesn’t like it.
- Reginald Jones reminded the group that as we think about our work we need to also think about dislocated workers and their needs for re-training - a point that was reiterated similarly by Omar Passons.
- Shaina Gross concurred that as a region we have long struggled being reactive instead of proactive.
- Jerry Butkiewicz added that he has served on advisory boards, provided feedback on curriculum, submitted letters of support, etc., but is still unsure of what exactly is needed to address the issues presented. Something needs to be created to highlight the need and make it easy for businesses to engage.

Mindful of time, Mark Cafferty then thanked the committee for their comments and time spent during the meeting. He reiterated that the work of this committee is not to identify what it is the Mayor can do to address the skills gap and better tie our education and business communities, but what can we all do, collectively, with city leadership to ensure we have a strong well prepared workforce that meets the needs of our key sectors and maximizes the region’s economic prosperity.

Before ending the meeting, Mark asked for the group’s agreement to focus the committee’s work on the five priority sectors that have been identified, ensuring small business and entrepreneurship continues to be emphasized, and to look into hosting a web presence that supports articulation and communication to the business community.

In closing, Mark made reference to several publications and initiatives, including the following, as they relate to the importance of business, community and education engagement/partnership. He further noted that there is no one way or model for successful engagement and strengthening our economic competitiveness. A few of the studies/resources mentioned are included below.

- [Committed to the Community: John Hopkins in East Baltimore](#)
- [The Achievement Gap Initiative \(AGI\) at Harvard University](#)
- [Jobs for the Future](#)

Mark announced that the next committee meeting date/time is Wednesday, May 13, from 2:30-4:00 p.m., and information will be e-mailed out in the weeks ahead regarding the location. Minutes and notes will be shared with the group and posted on the EDC website along with the agenda for the next meeting.

The meeting concluded at 4:32 p.m.